

Appointment of Contractual Medical Officers at Ayurvedic and Allopathic Dispensaries in Maharashtra

Background:

Health care delivery in India has been envisaged at three levels namely primary, secondary and tertiary. The preventive as well as curative health services are provided to the public through vast networks of Public Health Institutes like District Hospitals, General Hospitals, District Women Hospitals, Sub-district Hospitals, Rural Hospitals, Primary Health Centers, Dispensaries and Sub-centers. Additionally there are other institutes like Super-specialty Hospitals, TB Hospitals and Leprosy Hospitals which are few in numbers. These centres are however fulfilling the tasks entrusted to them only to a limited extent.

Dispensaries function as, an intermediary unit between PHC and SC level, delivers medical services to the rural population and functions in substantial numbers; Ayurvedic and Allopathic dispensaries being 475 & 131 respectively. Such dispensaries are manned with one BAMS Medical Officer (Gr-B/A) and one Attendant cum Dresser (Class IV). Additionally, Allopathic Dispensaries have one Pharmacist. The dispensaries which are located at village level are owned by Zilla Parishad (ZP) under control of PHC Medical Officer. Some of the dispensaries do not have own Govt./ZP building and are run in Gram Panchayat or any other community place in village. There are no residential quarters available for the staff; hence almost all Medical Officers stay in distant towns.

Table1: Circle wise Daily OPD attendance in Ayurvedic Dispensary

Name of Circle	Total operational dispensary	Total OPD patients treated			Average daily OPD attendance at dispensary		
		2011-12	2012-13	2013-14	2011-12	2012-13	2013-14
Thane	9	30391	44432	45073	12	18	18
Nasik	51	104235	116299	137804	7	8	9
Pune	18	42063	71182	92190	8	14	17
Kolhapur	43	62727	71808	70311	6	7	7
Aurangabad	14	26850	26106	30408	6	6	7
Latur	29	72972	76502	60999	9	9	8
Akola	188	309254	312268	334462	6	5	7
Nagpur	123	270748	251526	268584	8	8	8
Total	475	919240	970123	1039831	7	7	8

Source: Reports from District

The services provided are mostly OPD which run in the morning hardly for 3-4 hours (8.00 AM to 12 PM). These dispensaries are highly under-utilized as evident from the OPD attendance which is 7-8 patients per day at Ayurvedic dispensaries as shown in Table 1 above. The figures indicate the total operational dispensaries across various circles in the state. The figures indicate that Thane circle had the highest OPD attendance over a period three years from 2011-12 to 2013-14 & least number of OPD attendance has been recorded at Aurangabad over a period three years from 2011-12 to 2013-14. The Pune circle figures showed an increase in OPD attendance in the year 2012-13 & 2013-14.

Table2: Circle wise Daily OPD attendance in Allopathic Dispensary

Name of Circle	Total operational dispensaries	Total OPD patients treated			Average daily OPD at each dispensary		
		2011-12	2012-13	2013-14	2011-12	2012-13	2013-14
Thane	4	23164	21020	17818	18	17	15
Nashik*	1	0	0	0	0	0	0
Pune	4	14802	21061	31243	13	18	27
Kolhapur	8	27760	29887	30180	14	16	17
Aurangabad	13	86099	86143	86461	17	18	18
Latur	3	19903	20729	19992	23	24	23
Akola	34	91524	93542	104097	9	9	11
Nagpur	64	216633	216493	242517	10	9	10
Total	131	479885	488875	532308	13	13	14

Source: Report from District

* In Nasik Circle, district Jalgaon has reported zero OPD patients.

The figures in the table above indicate the total operational Allopathic dispensaries across various circles in the state. The highest total operational dispensaries were reported at Nagpur & the least operational dispensaries were reported at Nashik. The average daily OPD attendance was recorded to be highest in Latur circle & least in Nashik circle.

There are several audit objections with regards to poor utilization of dispensaries and waste of Government funds. The reasons for poor utilization or non-popularity of dispensaries are like non-availability of facilities, non availability of the doctors when required, out of stock medicines, and small catchment areas (only head-quarters and hardly any nearby villages).

The medicines supply to the dispensaries is very meager and its annual cost is about Rs. 20,000. The annual budget provided for office contingency from state budget is Rs. 2,000-5,000, which is quite meager; however Rs 25,000 untied funds for all dispensaries and Rs. 50,000 to those having own building, is provided annually through NHM.

The expenditure incurred on human resources, supplies and overheads of dispensaries is huge as against the benefit of very few OPD patients treated which is not cost effective; hence an alternate proposal is suggested as follows.

Proposal:

Human resource and cost of operation:

Total human resources (HR) positions at 606 dispensaries (475 Ayurvedic and 131 Allopathic respectively) include 408 Ayurvedic MOs, 114 Allopathy MOs, 119 Pharmacists and 559 Attendants. The total annual expenditure incurred on their salary amounts to Rs 4637 lakhs as revealed in Table-3.

Table-3: Category wise staff functioning and annual expenditure incurred

Category of staff	Sanctioned positions	Filled in	Pay Scale	Avg. Apx. Salary per month (Rs.)	Apx. Annual expenditure (Rs.)
MO (Gr-B), Ayurved	475	408	15600-39100 (Grade Pay- 5400) Group – B	44000	21,54,24,000
MO (Gr-A), Allopathy	131	114	15600-39100 (Grade Pay- 5400) Group- A.	54400	7,44,19,200
Pharmacist	131	119	9300-34000 Group- C	32500	4,64,10,000
Attendant Cum Dresser	606	559	Group- D	19000	12,74,52,000
Total					46,37,05,200

Total annual expenditure incurred on HR, medicines and supplies and overheads for these dispensaries is approximately Rs. 5169 lakhs as revealed in Table-4.

Table-4: Annual expenditure on dispensaries

Item of expenditure	Unit costs (Rs.)	Units	Amt. (Rs.)
HR Salary	-	-	46,37,05,200.00
Medicines and supplies	20,000	606	1,21,20,000.00
Office contingencies	5,000	606	30,30,000.00
Untied funds from NHM	25,000	606	1,51,50,000.00
Maintenance grants under NHM	50,000	473	2,36,50,000.00
Total			51,76,55,200.00

Considering only direct costs as inputs to run the dispensaries, the annual cost to operate the dispensaries is Rs. 5176 lakhs; whereas the output is only 1572139 patients treated annually in OPD, hence treatment costs per patient is around Rs. 329.26 which is very high and seems not to be cost effective, as shown in Table-5. Here the indirect costs like travel expenses of patients and overheads of supervisory and monitoring staff are not considered.

Table5: Expenditure and savings on Doctors if engaged on contractual basis:

Variable	Value (Rs.)
Annual expenditure on Salary of regular MO at Dispensaries	28,98,43,200.00
Annual expenditure on Contractual Doctors	10,90,80,000.00
Annual savings on salary of doctor (Annual expenditure on regular MOs – Annual expenditure on salary of contractual Doctors)	18,07,63,200.00
Total annual expenditure on all items (HR+ Overheads + Supplies)	51,76,55,200.00
Total Annual OPD patients treated	1572139.00
Average treatment costs per patient (Total Annual expenditure on all items/Total Annual OPD patients for the year 2013-14)	329.26

In light of the above facts, it is proposed to engage BAMS qualified contractual doctor instead of regular Medical Officers at dispensary. BAMS qualified doctors would be easily available in abundance. The consolidated salary disbursed to them could be Rs. 15,000 per month. They will handle the dispensary efficiently during morning hours (8.00 am to 12.00 pm) as well as in evening (16.00 pm to 18.00) hours.

Also, retired medical officers of public health department can be preferred if available. The expenditure on their consolidated salary per annum would be around Rs. 10, 90,80,000 (Rs. 15000x 606 doctors x 12 months), whereas the annual expenditure on salaries of regular MOs is Rs.28,98,43,200. Thus there would be savings of Rs. 18,07,63,200 every year. Additionally there will be no liability of their retirement benefits, which are not considered as part of this report.

At present, there are vacancies of 85 Medical Officers (68 Ayurvedic and 17 Allopathy respectively), which can be filled in on contractual basis.

The other regular staff like Pharmacists and Attendants will remain as it is and the vacancies which are there can be filled in on regular basis.

The existing Medical Officers functioning at Dispensaries are well experienced in implementation of National Health Programs as well as various health schemes, and are qualified at par with MO PHC. Therefore, they could be posted at PHCs as and when requirement arises via vacancies.

The responsibility of recruitment of contractual doctors shall rest with District Health Society. If agreed, the required Government shall issue orders and detail guidelines separately.

Advantages:

1. Experienced MOs will be available for filling in the vacant positions at PHCs.
2. There will be a substantial savings in expenditure on salary of doctors (Rs. 1807 lakhs per year) which can be utilized for supplies of adequate medicines to the dispensaries and up gradation of Health Institutes including dispensaries.
3. The assured OPD services will be available at dispensaries and therefore optimum utilization of dispensaries will be achieved.

Recommendations:

- ✓ The Medical Officers working at the dispensaries can be posted at PHCs against the vacancies
- ✓ Positions at dispensaries to be filled in by contractual doctors.

Annexure- I: District wise sanctioned and actual filled-in positions available at Ayurvedic Dispensaries.

Sr. No	Circles	Name of District	Post Sanctioned		Post Filled	
			MO	Attendant	MO	Attendant
1	Thane Circle	Thane	5	5	5	5
2		Raigarh	4	4	4	4
3		Ratnagiri	0	0	0	0
		Total	9	9	9	9
1	Nashik Circle	Nashik	10	10	10	10
2		Dhule	13	13	13	12
3		Nandurbar	8	0	8	0
4		Jalgaon	18	18	18	15
5		Ahmadnagar	2	1	2	0
		Total	51	42	51	37
1	Pune Circle	Pune	12	12	12	7
2		Solapur	6	6	6	2
		Total	18	18	18	9
1	Kolhapur Circle	Satara	17	17	6	7
2		Kolhapur	6	2	6	2
3		Sangli	15	14	7	8
4		Sindhudurg	5	5	4	4
		Total	43	38	17	21
1	Aurangabad Circle	Aurangabad	4	4	4	4
2		Jalna	3	3	2	3
3		Parbhani	4	4	3	4
4		Hingoli	3	3	0	3
		Total	14	14	9	14
1	Latur Circle	Latur	7	7	4	7
2		Osmanabad	7	3	7	3
3		Beed	8	8	2	5
5		Nanded	7	7	3	2
		Total	29	25	16	17
1	Akola Circle	Akola	25	25	25	19
2		Washim	9	7	8	6
3		Amravati	65	65	59	65
4		Yavatmal	19	19	18	13
5		Buldana	70	70	59	0
		Total	188	186	169	103
1	Nagpur Circle	Nagpur	33	7	31	5
2		Wardha	11	11	10	7
3		Bhandara	29	29	28	24
4		Gondiya	35	34	35	30
5		Chandrapur	10	10	9	4
6		Gadchiroli	5	5	5	5
		Total	123	96	118	75
		State Total	475	423	408	280

Annexure –II: District wise Sanctioned and actual filled-in positions available at Allopathic Dispensaries:

Sr. No	Circles	Name of District	Post Sanctioned			Post Filled		
			MO	Attendant	Pharmacist	MO	Attendant	Pharmacist
1	Thane Circle	Thane	0	0	0	0	0	0
2		Raigarh	3	3	3	3	3	3
3		Ratnagiri	1	0	0	1	0	0
		Total	4	3	3	4	3	3
1	Nashik Circle	Nashik	0	0	0	0	0	0
2		Dhule	0	0	0	0	0	0
3		Nandurbar	0	0	0	0	0	0
4		Jalgaon	1	1	1	1	1	1
5		Ahmednagar	0	0	0	0	0	0
		Total	1	1	1	1	1	1
1	Pune Circle	Pune	4	4	4	4	4	4
2		Solapur	0	0	0	0	0	0
		Total	4	4	4	4	4	4
1	Kolhapur Circle	Satara	0	0	0	0	0	0
2		Kolhapur	0	0	0	0	0	0
3		Sangli	3	3	3	3	3	3
4		Sindhudurg	5	1	5	3	1	4
		Total	8	4	8	6	4	7
1	Aurangabad Circle	Aurangabad	7	7	7	3	7	7
2		Jalna	0	0	0	0	0	0
3		Parbhani	4	12	4	4	9	4
4		Hingoli	2	4	2	0	2	2
		Total	13	23	13	7	18	13
1	Latur Circle	Latur	0	0	0	0	0	0
2		Osmanabad	3	6	3	2	5	3
3		Beed	0	0	0	0	0	0
5		Nanded	0	0	0	0	0	0
		Total	3	6	3	2	5	3
1	Akola Circle	Akola	8	8	6	8	6	6
2		Washim	2	3	2	2	3	2
3		Amravati	18	18	18	17	18	18
4		Yavatmal	1	1	1	1	1	0
5		Buldana	5	5	9	3	0	9
		Total	34	35	36	31	28	35
1	Nagpur Circle	Nagpur	28	29	29	27	29	26
2		Wardha	20	20	20	17	13	19
3		Bhandara	4	4	4	3	4	4
4		Gondiya	3	3	3	3	3	3
5		Chandrapur	9	9	5	9	8	1
6		Gadchiroli	0	0	0	0	0	0
		Total	64	65	61	59	57	53
			131	141	129	114	120	119

Annexure – III: District wise OPD at Ayurvedic Dispensaries:

Sr. No	Name of District	Total operational	Total OPD			Average yearly OPD at each dispensary			Average daily OPD at each dispensary		
			2011-12	2012-13	2013-14	2011-12	2012-13	2013-14	2011-12	2012-13	2013-14
Thane Circle											
1	Thane	5	16771	20223	19245	3354	4045	3849	12	14	13
2	Raigarh	4	13620	24209	25828	3405	6052	6457	12	21	22
3	Ratnagiri	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Nashik Circle											
1	Nashik	10	20059	23112	29494	2006	2311	2949	7	8	10
2	Dhule	13	27495	29084	33037	2115	2237	2541	7	8	9
3	Nandurbar	8	11147	14582	24168	1393	1823	3021	5	6	10
4	Jalgaon	18	40137	44356	46208	2230	2464	2567	8	9	9
5	Ahmadnagar	2	5397	5165	4897	2699	2583	2449	9	9	9
Pune Circle											
1	Pune	12	28802	49024	68241	2400	4085	5687	8	14	20
2	Solapur	6	13261	22158	23949	2210	3693	3992	8	13	14
Kolhapur Circle											
1	Satara	17	16604	19989	17238	977	1176	1014	3	4	4
2	Kolhapur	6	19375	19409	17809	3229	3235	2968	11	11	10
3	Sangli	15	17231	22578	24284	1149	1505	1619	4	5	6
4	Sindhudurg	5	9517	9832	10980	1903	1966	2196	7	7	8
Aurangabad Circle											
1	Aurangabad	4	8673	11697	12992	2168	2924	3248	8	10	11
2	Jalna	3	1724	1902	2088	575	634	696	2	2	2
3	Parbhani	4	15172	10339	12969	3793	2585	3242	13	9	11
4	Hingoli	3	1281	2168	2359	427	723	786	1	3	3
Latur Circle											
1	Latur	7	11525	18411	7623	1646	2630	1089	6	9	4
2	Osmanabad	7	33342	32163	29890	4763	4595	4270	17	16	15

3	Beed	8	14644	12147	9126	1831	1518	1141	6	5	4
4	Nanded	7	13461	13781	14360	1923	1969	2051	7	7	7
Akola Circle											
1	Akola	25	38439	36791	42883	1538	1472	1715	5	5	6
2	Washim	9	12582	10658	14909	1398	1184	1657	5	4	6
3	Amravati	65	136375	126150	130487	2098	1941	2007	7	7	7
4	Yavatmal	19	30994	33467	47720	1631	1761	2512	6	6	9
5	Buldana	70	90864	105202	98463	1298	1503	1407	5	5	5
Nagpur Circle											
1	Nagpur	33	62690	66496	65336	1900	2015	1980	7	7	7
2	Wardha	11	21973	21746	23606	1998	1977	2146	7	7	7
3	Bhandara	29	43201	54195	55760	1490	1869	1923	5	6	7
4	Gondiya	35	109015	73299	83592	3115	2094	2388	11	7	8
5	Chandrapur	10	19197	20355	24081	1920	2036	2408	7	7	8
6	Gadchiroli	5	14672	15435	16209	2934	3087	3242	10	11	11
Total		475	919240	970123	1039831	1935	2042	2189	7	7	8

Annexure – IV: District wise OPD at Allopathic Dispensaries:

Sr. No	Name of District	Total operational	Total OPD at district (Yearly)			Average yearly OPD at each dispensary			Average daily OPD at each dispensary		
			2011-12	2012-13	2013-14	2011-12	2012-13	2013-14	2011-12	2012-13	2013-14
Thane Circle											
1	Thane	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
2	Raigarh	3	19494	16817	14089	6498	5606	4696	23	19	16
3	Ratnagiri	1	3670	4203	3729	3670	4203	3729	13	15	13
Nashik Circle											
1	Nashik	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
2	Dhule	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
3	Nandurbar	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
4	Jalgaon	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
5	Ahmadnagar	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Pune Circle											

1	Pune	4	14802	21061	31243	3701	5265	7811	13	18	27
2	Solapur	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Kolhapur Circle											
1	Satara	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
2	Kolhapur	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
3	Sangli	3	19079	23265	24877	6360	7755	8292	22	27	29
4	Sindhudurg	5	8681	6622	5303	1736	1324	1061	6	5	4
Aurangabad Circle											
1	Aurangabad	7	65526	66225	62652	9361	9461	8950	33	33	31
2	Jalna	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
3	Parbhani	4	18707	17092	20905	4677	4273	5226	16	15	18
4	Hingoli	2	1866	2826	2904	933	1413	1452	3	5	5
Latur Circle											
1	Latur	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
2	Osmanabad	3	19903	20729	19992	6634	6910	6664	23	24	23
3	Beed	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
4	Nanded	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Akola Circle											
1	Akola	8	17701	18511	13203	2213	2314	1650	8	8	6
2	Washim	2	6236	6446	5401	3118	3223	2701	11	11	9
3	Amravati	18	45979	48143	48817	2554	2675	2712	9	9	9
4	Yavatmal	1	1498	1546	1367	1498	1546	1367	5	5	5
5	Buldana	5	20110	18896	35309	4022	3779	7062	14	13	25
Nagpur Circle											
1	Nagpur	28	95084	105867	122467	3396	3781	4374	12	13	15
2	Wardha	20	81347	73478	74028	4067	3674	3701	14	13	13
3	Bhandara	4	12756	9254	10991	3189	2314	2748	11	8	10
4	Gondiya	3	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
5	Chandrapur	9	27446	27894	35031	3050	3099	3892	11	11	14
6	Gadchiroli	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Total		131	479885	488875	532308	3663	3732	4063	13	13	14